

# MINUTES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL COUNCIL

# MEETING HELD VIRTUALLY VIA ZOOM ON 24 NOVEMBER 2020

Present:	Mrs Carmel Booth, President (in the Chair); Dr Paul Johnson, Vice-President; Professor Dame Janet Beer, Vice-Chancellor; Professor Gavin Brown, Pro- Vice-Chancellor for Education; Professor Anthony Hollander, Pro-Vice- Chancellor for Research and Impact; Dr Carol Costello, Director of People and Services; Mr Adnan Hussain, President of the Guild of Students; Ms Cilla Ankrah-Lucas; Ms Fiona Cullen; Mr Ed Fishwick; Dr Kashmir Gill; Ms Vanessa Griffiths; Mrs Helen Miller; Mr Norman Molyneux; Dr Roger Platt; Mr Hans van Mourik Broekman; Dr Diana Walford; Professor Julia Balogun; Professor Hazel Scott; Professor Thomas Teubner; and Mr Kieran O'Sullivan.
In Attendance:	Ms Nicola Davies, Director of Finance; Mr Kevan Ryan, Clerk to Council; and Mrs Emma Leonard, Governance Manager, Secretary to Council.

## UNRESERVED BUSINESS

#### COMMITTEE AND MEMBERSHIP MATTERS

#### 1. Welcome

Ms Fiona Cullen, Dr Kashmir Gill and Ms Vanessa Griffiths were welcomed to their first Council meeting.

#### 2. Council Membership 2020/21

#### **RECEIVED** and **NOTED**:

i. Council membership for 2020/21.

#### 3. Council: Roles and Responsibilities

#### **RECEIVED** and **NOTED**:

i. The annual report bringing together a range of information on the role of Council and its members, members' legal and fiduciary responsibilities as charitable trustees, the expectations the University has of them, and the support members can expect to receive from the University in discharging these duties.

#### 4. Delegation Scheme

# RECEIVED:

i. A revised version of the Scheme of Delegation.

## **REPORTED**:

ii. As part of its enhancement plan, the Governance Team was currently undertaking a review of the Scheme of Delegation to: compare it with practice elsewhere; add more detail and clarification where necessary; make it more user friendly and searchable; and add additional context, eg descriptions of minor and major changes. In the meantime, minor updates had been made to correct any factually incorrect information (eg statutory framework references, role titles) so that the Scheme of Delegation remained fit for purpose whilst the broader review was undertaken.

# AGREED:

iii. The revised Scheme of Delegation should be approved.

# 5. Guidance on Diversity and Equality Compliance for Committees

# **RECEIVED** and **NOTED**:

i. A statement, updated for 2020/21, which was presented annually at the first meeting of all committees/boards to highlight the University's commitment to promoting equality in order to comply with the Equality Act 2010 and the Public Sector Equality Duty.

## 6. Statement of Policy and Procedure on Disclosure of Interest

# **RECEIVED** and **NOTED**:

i. The University's Statement of Policy and Procedure on Disclosure of Interest, in accordance with the Policy requirement that 'at their first meeting of the academic year, each committee within the University should have a standing item on their agenda about conflict of interest'.

## 7. Disclosures of Interest

Members were asked to disclose any interest that could give rise to conflict in relation to any item on the agenda. No such interests were disclosed.

## 8. Minutes of Previous Meetings

## 8.1 <u>Unreserved Minutes of the Meeting Held on 7 July 2020</u>

## AGREED:

i. The unreserved minutes of the meeting held on 7 July 2020 should be approved as an accurate record.

## 8.2 Minutes of the Away Day Meeting Held on 13 October 2020

## AGREED:

i. The minutes of the Away Day meeting held on 13 October 2020 should be approved as an accurate record.

# 9. Report on Action Taken by the President and Matters Dealt with Via Circulation Since the Last Business Meeting

## **REPORTED**:

i. Since the last business meeting of Council, the President had taken action on its behalf as follows:

Longer Term Investment Strategy: Reduction in Equities (approved 8.7.20) Minute redacted due to commercial interest.

#### USS Debt Monitoring Pension Consultation Response (approved 30.7.20)

To approve the University's consultation response which indicated that the University, in keeping with a number of other Russell Group institutions, did not support the new framework introduction. The reason for the proposal was an aim to keep the employer covenant as strong – however, the University's view was that this framework brought too much risk with it, may not result in a strong covenant anyway, and that overall the USS scheme needed benefit reform.

#### <u>University of Liverpool Pension Fund – Consultation on Investment Matters</u> (approved 9.10.20)

To endorse, on behalf of both the Planning and Resources Committee and the Council, the decisions made at the University of Liverpool Pension Fund (ULPF) Trustee Board meeting held on 23 September 2020 to agree:

- A change to the equity component of the ULPF benchmark investment strategy
- An updated version of the Statement of Investment Principles incorporating the requirements of the Occupational Pension Schemes (Investment and Disclosure) (Amendment) Regulations 2019.

## Senate Election to Council (approved 12.8.20)

To approve the recommendation made via Chair's action on behalf of the Senate to approve the protocols/approach to conducting an election to fill the vacancy for an elected Senate representative on Council.

#### Updated Student Protection Plan (approved 9.10.20)

To approve the recommendation made via Chair's action on behalf of the Education Committee and the Senate to approve an updated Student Protection Plan.

Whilst the sector awaited further guidance from the OfS on Student Protection Plans (SPP), an interim review of the University's existing-approved SPP had been undertaken to update a number of sections that included factual content that was now either out of date or no longer accurate. A full review of the SPP, with a more detailed consultation exercise, would be undertaken once further guidance was released from the OfS.

[Secretary's note: The updated SPP had been submitted to the OfS and a response had been received to state that the suitability of the plan would be assessed in due course. In the interim, the University had been asked not to publish the amended plan, as ongoing condition of registration C3 required the plan to be approved by the OfS prior to it being published.]

## Council Appointments to Committees

To approve on behalf of the Nominations Committee and the Council:

- The appointment of Ms Claire Snell as an independent member of the Remuneration Committee for the period from 1 August 2020 to 31 July 2023 (approved 21.7.20)
- The appointment of Professor Julia Balogun as a member of the Nominations Committee for the period from 29 October 2020 to 31 July 2021 (approved 29.10.20).
- ii. Since the last business meeting of Council, the following matters had been dealt with via email circulation to members, with proposals amended in accordance with members' comments as appropriate:

## City Plan (circulated 22.7.20)

Council agreed that the Vice-Chancellor should sign off on the City Plan which aimed to:

- Provide a shared vision and strategic framework for all city stakeholders
- Transform public services to achieve better outcomes for residents and ensure services are increasingly preventative, proactive and person centred
- Steer the city's recovery from COVID-19 and provide a clear plan to deliver the Local Industrial Strategy
- Agree a clear set of shared outcomes which all public service providers are committed to address
- Demonstrate collective city leadership and position Liverpool as an exemplar in the development of place based policy and city management.

#### Consultation on the USS Trustee's Proposed Methodology and Assumptions for the Scheme's Technical Provisions in Relation to the 2020 Valuation (circulated 26.10.20)

Council approved the University's proposed consultation response. In general, it was considered that there was still too much uncertainty about the overall picture and the impacts of any decisions, but a response had been made which set out the University's views on the key areas to concentrate on in considering the 2020 valuation and the future of USS.

## Appointment of Lay Members (circulated 4.11.20)

- Council agreed the recommendations of the Nominations Committee that:
- Ms Fiona Cullen should be appointed as a lay member from 9 November 2020 to 31 July 2023
- Dr Kashmir Gill should be appointed as a lay member from 9 November 2020 to 31 July 2023
- Ms Vanesa Griffiths should be appointed as a lay member from 9 November 2020 to 31 July 2023.

# AGREED:

iii. The action taken by the President on Council's behalf as outlined in 9i above should be endorsed.

## **ITEMS FOR APPROVAL/NOTE**

#### **10.** Vice-Chancellor's Communications

#### 10.1 Oral Report

#### **RECEIVED**:

i. An oral report from the Vice-Chancellor.

#### **REPORTED**:

ii. A taught student pulse survey had been open from 9 - 20 November 2020. The results would help the University to understand how students feel about their experience of studying at the University this year and how they can best be supported in the coming months.

## AGREED:

iii. A summary of the survey results should be shared with Council in due course.

#### 10.2 Summary of External Engagements

## **REPORTED**:

i. Since the last meeting of Council, the Vice-Chancellor had met with, hosted or attended meetings regarding the following:

2 September	Times Higher Education World Economic Forum – Private Roundtable Discussion		
	Russell Group Update with Ministers Michelle Donelan and Amanda Solloway		
3 September	National Leadership Centre Extraordinary Advisory Board		
4 September	Shaping our Future with Alex Chisholm – National Leadership		
	Centre		
	Local MP Update		
8 September	N8 Remuneration Committee		
9 September	UUK Board		
10 September	r UUK Members Meeting		
	British Council Update		
11 September	EUA Leadership Roundtable		
	Parent and Family Welcome Event		
15 September	Universities UK International Policy Network		
16 September	National Leadership Centre Launch		
17 September			
	AHRC Board		
	Hosted Minister for Science, Amanda Solloway MP, on Campus		
22 September	EUA Conference Plenary: Future of EU Funding for Education		
	and Research		
24 September	Russell Group Board with Kevin Foster MP, Immigration Minister		
25 September	LCR Combined Authority Meeting		
30 September	Liverpool Strategic Partnership Meeting		
	Jon Snow, Channel 4 Campus Tour and Interview		

2 October 6 October 8 October 9-11 October 12 October 14 October	Pontignano Conference: UK and Italy: Working Together UUK International Strategic Advisory Board Russell Group/USS Discussion Liverpool Literary Festival National Leadership Centre Advisory Board AHRC Assurance Board Eradicating Modern Slavery Debate		
15 October	Knowledge Quarter and Sciontec Boards		
20 October	N8 Board Ministerial Roundtable (UUKi) on Horizon Europe and Alternatives Russell Group Board – USS Discussion		
22 October 28 October 30 October 5 November 6 November 11 November 12 November	UUK COVID Update Russell Group/Wellcome Trust Roundtable EUA Council Meeting (UUKI) Russell Group Board UUK Board UUK COVID Update LCC Education Improvement Board.		

# 11. Liverpool Guild of Students Update

#### **RECEIVED**:

i. A presentation by the President of the Guild of Students providing an Officer Team update and a round up of activity to date during Semester One.

- ii. The Guild Officer Team had been working to improve the student experience, support and facilities within the University and the Guild of Students. Their efforts had focused on various matters, such as:
  - COVID-19 support
  - Drug harm reduction
  - Sexual misconduct
  - Improving mental health provision
  - Racial equality
  - Reforming module selection.
- iii. Parts of the Guild building had reopened for Welcome Week. Since the beginning of the second lockdown the Guild shop had closed, the food services and coffee shop were takeaway only, and the Courtyard and Mountford were open as study spaces.
- iv. All society activity had been online only, with societies being supported by the Guild to offer interesting and varied events. 62 events (commercial, Give it a Go and society led) had been held in the Native platform. The Give it a Go programme had seen 438 attendees participating across 24 sessions ranging from crafternoons, Netflix parties, beekeeping, herb pot planting and various society sessions. Society memberships stood at a very healthy 18,000+, with unique memberships at 6,750 (against 9,651 and 6,149 in 2019/20).

## NOTED:

v. The Liverpool Guild of Students had presented a report to senior leaders at the University setting out a number of recommendations for consideration in light of student concerns around the ongoing impacts of the pandemic, including a partial accommodation fee refund. Consideration of the recommendations would now be progressed through the normal decision-making channels, noting how complex and interwoven the various issues were and how they were affecting the entire sector.

# 12. Of S Annual Financial Return 2019/20

# RECEIVED:

i. Various elements of the annual financial return which the University was required to submit to the Office for Students (OfS).

- ii. All providers registered with the OfS were required to satisfy general ongoing condition of registration F3: Provision of information to the OfS. The OfS had issued guidance for the annual financial return on 9 September 2020 and the requirements included:
  - Signed audited financial statements that are fully compliant with the OfS' accounts direction
  - External auditor's management letter and the provider's management response to this
  - Financial and student number tables in the template from the OfS that the provider has completed in full
  - Commentary in the template from the OfS that the provider has completed
  - Optional: A business plan which sets out the provider's plans for the same period as the financial and student number table this was only mandatory for providers with less than three years' operation and it was proposed that the University would not submit such a plan
  - Transparent Approach to Costing (TRAC) return which would be considered by the Planning and Resources Committee at its meeting on 12 January 2021, for submission to the OfS by 1 March 2021. The Transparent Approach to Costing for Teaching (TRAC (T)) return was not required this year.
- iii. Historically, the Audit Committee annual report, PwC internal audit annual report and a research assurance statement were requested by OfS as part of the return, but these were not required this year.
- iv. The annual financial statements had been prepared using the Accounts Direction published by the OfS in October 2019. The USS pension credit in the year of £60.1m had had a significant impact on the financial statements. This would be the case for all institutions that had members in the USS pension scheme.
- v. Within the external audit year end report, four new recommendations had been raised, compared with nine in the previous year. Two of these recommendations related to the new requirement from the OfS to report on the Access and

Participation Plan within the financial statements. One related to ensuring adequate review and controls on accounting for the University of Liverpool Pension Fund and ensuring correct treatment of surplus. The final point related to electronic signing of ULCCO contracts. All points would be addressed during the year and prior to next year end.

vi. The financial tables and associated commentary included the five year plan submission, and, owing to the ongoing uncertainty regarding the final position on student fee income, it was proposed to delay submission in line with the OfS extended deadline of 1 February 2021. Although uncertainty would remain until after the submission date, the first forecast for 2020/21 would enable some aspects to be clarified, in particular the overseas undergraduate student numbers, elements of overseas PGT student numbers, and the impact of COVID on the cost base, including likely impact on travel costs, and ability to meet savings targets that had been put in place for this financial year. Following the finalisation of the forecast, the likely impact on future years could be reviewed and the plan amended for any material changes. This was important because a deficit position was being submitted for 2020/21 through to 2022/23 of between £11m and £32m each year.

# AGREED:

- vii. The audited financial statements and external auditor's year end report should be approved for submission to the OfS on 1 December 2020.
- viii. The submission of the financial and student number tables and associated financial commentary should be approved, subject to any amendments to be considered by the Planning and Resources Committee at its meeting on 12 January 2021, for submission to the OfS on 1 February 2021. The revised version would also be shared with Council.

# 13. Assessment of the Impact of COVID-19 on the University of Liverpool as a Going Concern

## **RECEIVED**:

i. A paper providing an assessment of the University as a financial going concern in light of the recent, current and ongoing impact of COVID-19 on the University's operations for two years from and including 2020/21.

- ii. The assessment covered a thorough testing of the University's financial position over the next two years to changes in:
  - Income streams (student fee, research and commercial)
  - The viability of the partners in various partnerships (eg Kaplan, XJTLU, etc.)
  - The viability of various subsidiaries (eg ULCCO)
  - The robustness of supply chains that deliver infrastructure and IT services that might lead to changes in costs
  - The availability of sufficient volume and quality of staff to deliver operations
  - Financial instruments such as the private placement and the covenants within them

- Regulation and policy changes such as Brexit.
- iii. The assessment also covered what mitigations would be taken to offset any vulnerabilities as well as what controls were in place to manage expenditure and cash flow.
- iv. Key points from the report were as follows:
  - Noting the treasury policy minimum of £60m, the University had significant reserves of varying liquidity as well as a number of mitigations to allocate against short-term deficits without resorting to borrowing
  - The largest risks to viability surrounded student fee income particularly from overseas markets
  - There was lower risk exposure to the viability of educational partnerships, subsidiaries and operational supply chains. This also included Brexit as much of the risk had been priced in
  - There was little risk to the availability, in volume and quality, of qualified staff to continue to deliver outputs
  - Over the next two years, in the realistic scenario the exposure was estimated to be deficits after mitigation of £26m and £40m. In the pessimistic scenario the deficits increased to £54m and £66m
  - The cash position in both scenarios, with mitigations deployed, did not fall below the treasury minimum of £60
  - A worst case scenario had been included at the request of the external auditors in which cash dropped below £60m to £9.3m by July 2022. However, in that unlikely scenario there were more significant mitigations that could be put in place, in particular use of endowment funds and further reduction in capital spend, which would increase cash levels to c£51m, below the treasury £60m policy.
- v. External audit had requested Letters of Support for the following subsidiary companies and joint ventures:
  - University of Liverpool Energy Company Ltd
  - ULCCO (Special Projects) Ltd
  - University of Liverpool Construction Company Ltd
  - Sensor City Liverpool Ltd (Joint Venture with LJMU).
- vi. KPMG had indicated that they were satisfied with the going concern position following a review of the going concern paper and the underpinning financial modelling.

## NOTED:

vii. The Planning and Resources Committee would be carefully monitoring planned mitigation strategies and progress against planned savings targets and work streams.

## AGREED:

viii. The University's position as a going concern should be approved.

ix. The letters of support referred to in 13v above should be issued.

## 14. OfS – Annual Self-Assessment Compliance Report

## RECEIVED:

i. A report providing assurance to Council in relation to how the University is currently complying with the conditions of the Office for Students (OfS) regulatory framework and highlighting areas of potential risk or where further work is progressing. Also appended to the report was a copy of the University's Reportable Events process, with a summary of the events reported to the OfS between October 2019 and October 2020.

## **REPORTED**:

- ii. Condition E3 of the OfS regulatory framework placed accountability for ensuring the University's compliance with all of its conditions of registration directly on its governing body.
- iii. A centralised approach to overseeing compliance had been retained, now through the University Secretary and Director of Legal and Governance. This enabled an effective joined up approach within the University between senior management and activity leads. Overall, there was an understanding and awareness, through the activity leads, of what action needed to be taken to achieve compliance. Where gaps had been identified, plans were either progressing or in development to address any issues.
- iv. A key focus of the activity was to achieve compliance whilst simultaneously identifying ways to add value to current University practices where possible.
- v. Overall, the majority (19/25) of conditions had been assessed as green, with those conditions highlighted as amber (5/25) having plans in place to address requirements as necessary. This was similar to last year's report, where 18/24 had been assessed as green, 5/24 as amber and 1/24 as not applicable. An assessment of red would suggest a serious gap in policy/process with no clear plan to address this. Council could take assurance that no area had been assessed as red.

# AGREED:

vi. The University's internal assessment of its compliance against the conditions of the OfS regulatory framework should be approved.

## 15. Prevent Annual Report and Annual Monitoring Return

[The Director of Student Administration and Support, Dr Paula Harrison Woods, attended for this item.]

## **RECEIVED**:

i. The Prevent Annual Data Return and Annual Report.

## **REPORTED**:

- ii. The Prevent Annual Report provided an overview of how the University had met its obligations under the Prevent Duty in the preceding year. Council was required to confirm it was satisfied that the obligations had been met.
- iii. The Annual Monitoring Return was in a format defined by the OfS and used information from the Annual Report. The narrative statement had specific requirements this year in relation to welfare in light of COVID.
- iv. Some minor amendments had been made to the Annual Data Return following circulation and some additional narrative from the Annual Report had been included in the Return.
- v. Enhancing the levels of training provided to staff was currently being explored.

## AGREED:

- vi. The Prevent Annual Data Return should be approved for submission to the OfS.
- vii. The Prevent Annual Report should be approved.

#### 16. Strategic Change Portfolio: Update

[The Director of Strategic Change, Ms Karen Banks; Head of Project and Programme Management, Mrs Rachel Parkes; Programme Manager for the Canvas at Liverpool Project, Mr Andy Dolben; Professor of Chemistry, Professor Helen Aspinall; and Canvas Coaches Mr Jack Roddy and Ms Sophie Hook attended for this item.]

## **RECEIVED**:

i. A presentation providing an overview of the Strategic Change Department, an update on the CAMPUS Shield Project, and an update on the Canvas Project (the University's new virtual learning environment).

- ii. The CAMPUS Shield Project had delivered a city-wide approach for HEIs to ensure a COVID-safe environment for staff and students, recognising the University's civic duty to manage the risks involved. The University's COVID Test Centre had successfully opened on 14 September 2020, providing testing seven days a week for UoL and LJMU staff and students. A Central COVID Contact Centre had also been established. Training had taken place in late September, supported by the local city council's Health Protection Team, and a seven-day support service for contact tracing and welfare checks for all staff and students was now available.
- iii. The Outbreak Response Team continued to meet to review case data and numbers in isolation to determine when additional action was required. The CAMPUS Shield lead and manager coordinated an HEI Outbreak Network which met weekly, bringing together HEIs across the city to work together on COVID matters with the local city council, police and private student accommodation

providers. This group was now providing COVID data for the project to collate and report to the Health Protection Board overseeing such matters in Liverpool.

- iv. The project's current focus was on supporting the roll out of mass asymptomatic testing in the city. The Mass Asymptomatic Serial Testing programme was a follow on from the city's current asymptomatic testing and would focus on targeted testing for priority groups. University staff and students were identified as one of the priority groups and this aspect of the programme was being governed within CAMPUS Shield. It was hoped that the asymptomatic testing regime would support plans for student travel at Christmas, provide an ongoing in-house testing programme, and support the return of students after Christmas.
- v. VITAL (Blackboard) had been the University's virtual learning environment for over ten years and it no longer met the University's needs or the expectations of students. The decision to change platforms had followed extensive consultation in 2019 with staff and students across all Faculties and relevant PS areas. Canvas had been chosen after a rigorous tender process because of the following capabilities:
  - Better alignment with the University's educational vision
  - Supports attainment of University Hallmarks and Attributes via the curriculum (authentic assessment and digital literacy etc.)
  - Supports blended learning, bringing the best of on-campus experience into online spaces
  - New functionality supports innovative teaching practices
  - Cloud-based platform which means Canvas can evolve and keep pace with new trends in teaching and online learning
  - Better basic functionality
  - Increased flexibility in course design
  - Modern and intuitive interface
  - Easier navigation, with clear menus
  - A mobile learning platform with seamless integration between mobile devices and desktops
  - Improved accessibility and usability
  - Enhanced 24/7 support and guidance for all users.
- vi. Managing the transition from VITAL to Canvas had involved an active Sponsor and Steering Group, an extensive staff training programme and bespoke sessions via a team of Canvas Coaches, targeted resources for students to support induction, targeted staff and student communications, a new Canvas Connect Community of Practice and weekly 'Canvas and Coffee' sessions.
- vii. Canvas had already been used to successfully support the delivery of central and local courses during Foundation Week and a Chemistry Virtual Summer School had been run, bridging the gap between A-Levels and starting university.

## AGREED:

viii. The agile approach being taken should be commended.

# 17. Sustainability Strategy

[The Director of Estates Management, Mr Syd Cottle, and the Senior Policy Advisor, Mr James Coe, attended for this item.]

# RECEIVED:

i. A paper providing the Sustainability Strategy.

## **REPORTED**:

- ii. The Sustainability Strategy was the culmination of years of growing activity. The University had embedded sustainability at its heart through signing up to the UN Sustainable Development Goals (UN SDGs) Accord in January 2020, had made great leaps in its green credentials, and, with the exceptional work of the Liverpool Guild of Students, had built a greater culture of environmental accountability on campus. The University continued to strengthen its position as a leader in sustainability across the higher education sector.
- iii. Following on from signing up to the UN SDGs, the University had established seven key workings groups to drive forward its sustainability commitments. The Strategy synthesised their diverse activity into a single plan, and in turn nestled sustainability commitments within wider University strategies. As a result, the Strategy was high level, and intended to give a clear overview of the University's sustainability work to students, staff and partners. Underneath this sat an action plan that was being continually developed to drive the work of each of the groups forward. Web pages on the work of partners and each group would sit alongside the Strategy.

## AGREED:

- iv. The Sustainability Strategy should be approved.
- v. Given her expertise in this area, Ms Griffiths should liaise with the relevant University representatives to provide input and share best practice.

# 18. The University's Response to Legacies of Slavery and Colonialism: Naming, Wealth and Collections

[The Pro-Vice-Chancellor for Cultural Engagement, Professor Dinah Birch, attended for this item.]

## **RECEIVED**:

i. A paper describing a number of potential areas for discussion in relation to the University's approach to the legacies of slavery and colonialism.

## **REPORTED**:

ii. Owing to the University's date of foundation (1881), there was confidence that no direct proceeds of slavery had contributed to the initial endowment or other fundraising. However, it was undoubtedly the case that:

- Intergenerational transmission of funds derived from slavery, and other aspects of the Victorian economy that we would now deem unacceptable, had played a role
- The University's Heritage Collections contained items acquired under the influence of colonial attitudes, and donations originally purchased using resources derived from the intergenerational transmission of funds referred to above
- More generally, the University's activities would, throughout its history, have been influenced by the attitudes of the day. As such, a number of the people recognised by the University through naming, and, no doubt, other past members of staff and students, would have themselves been the beneficiaries, or indeed proponents, of acts or opinions we now deem unacceptable, and which are contrary to our values of inclusion and tolerance.
- iii. The University wished to investigate and articulate openly and honestly how the legacies of slavery and colonialism had manifested themselves throughout the University's history and contributed to its current position. It was proposed this work should be undertaken through three strands of activity:
  - A full audit of University Naming and review of the Framework for Naming
  - A full audit of heritage collections, held in the Victoria Gallery and Museum, Garstang and Special Collections and Archives
  - An audit of private funding received by the University over the course of its history, including consideration of the intergenerational transmission of funds.
- iv. It was proposed to underpin this work with resource from the Horsfall Endowment, which was for the purposes of maintaining and promoting the University's Heritage Collections. The proposed release of £50k of endowment income would support the development and initial implementation of a project plan to understand the ways in which the University had benefitted from private wealth derived from the city's economy since its foundation, and to ensure its heritage collections are interpreted appropriately and made more accessible in the same context.
- v. Work on the University's past and present naming practices was well underway. A small group had been established over summer 2020 to consider these matters. A consultation would solicit opinions from staff, students, alumni, local stakeholders and community groups. It was proposed that the group should continue to meet with a view to bringing any recommendations required to fully update the Naming Framework in response to the consultation to Council.

## AGREED:

- vi. The overall approach described in the paper, including the use of income related to the Horsfall Endowment to underpin this work, should be approved, noting the importance of ensuring the linking of this work with other related strands of activity and the careful and sensitive management required.
- vii. The timeline for the consultation on naming and review of the Naming Framework should be approved.

## 19. Development and Alumni Relations Annual Report

[The Director of Development and Alumni Relations, Ms Christina Harcus, attended for this item.]

# RECEIVED:

i. A paper providing an update on the Development and Alumni Relations Team's performance in 2019/20.

# **REPORTED**:

- ii. Following agreement from the Senior Leadership Team in September 2018, and an approved business case for investment in the area, the Team had set its ambitious five-year strategy to 2023. Two key annual targets had been agreed, measuring fundraised income and volunteer hours undertaken. The Team entered the academic year 2019/20 on track to achieve both targets. However, the COVID-19 pandemic had impacted performance in the last six months of the year, and had required the existing strategy and operational roadmap to be revised, not only to circumvent the many challenges but also to take advantage of the opportunities presented. Thus, the Team ended 2019/20 achieving £2,935,722 against the target of £4million new funds raised and 5,311 against the target of 10,000 volunteering hours.
- iii. In light of the COVID-19 pandemic, the proposal of the Director of Development and Alumni Relations to reduce the Team's targets this academic year, and for the next two years, had been agreed. This would allow the Team to engage with academic colleagues and to focus on the careful cultivation of new donors, aligning them to strategic priorities, and the thoughtful stewardship of current donors and volunteers.
- iv. The Team had responded quickly to the COVID-19 pandemic and had launched an emergency fundraising campaign within a week of the mandate to work from home. Three clear calls to action had been created: to fund vital research, to support our students and to secure personal protective equipment. The overall campaign total raised to date was £449,478 resulting from 535 donations. A key objective of the campaign was to engage and attract new donors to the University and 59% of all gifts had been received from first time donors.
- v. With the situation remaining changeable, most alumni and supporter engagement activities would continue to be online. Digital engagement strategies would be developed to support key objectives around volunteering, graduate outcomes and rankings and international engagement. Whilst current travel restrictions limited the Team's capacity to hold in person events this next academic year, the 'new normal' of online events provided great opportunity to engage further the University's global alumni community.

# AGREED:

vi. The revised targets of the Team should be endorsed.

vii. Ms Harcus, who was leaving the University, should be thanked for her work and wished well for her future career.

# **REPORTS FROM COUNCIL'S COMMITTEES**

#### 20. Audit Committee

#### 20.1 Audit Committee Annual Report

#### **RECEIVED**:

i. The Annual Report of the Audit Committee describing the work of the Committee and how it gained the assurances that enable it, in turn, to assure the Council on the robustness of the University's systems of internal control. The report included sections on: membership, meetings and terms of reference; CUC Higher Education Audit Committee Code of Practice 2020; internal and external audit arrangements and findings; risk management; data assurance; value for money; fraud; OfS regulatory framework; Audit Committee effectiveness; training, development and additional context provided for members; and the Committee's annual opinion.

#### **REPORTED**:

ii. The overall opinion on the system of internal control which had been included in the Audit Committee's Annual Report was that:

'On the basis of the work undertaken by the internal and external auditors and the action plans agreed by management, and following consideration of other matters presented to the Committee by management, the Audit Committee has concluded that it is satisfied with the adequacy and effectiveness of the arrangements that the University has in place for:

- risk management, control and governance
- economy, efficiency and effectiveness (value for money)
- management and quality assurance of data submitted to the Higher Education Statistics Agency, the Student Loans Company, the OfS and other bodies, subject to the ongoing successful implementation of the measures that have been put in place to address issues relating to data quality and process issues in student statutory returns'.

#### AGREED:

iii. The Annual Report of the Audit Committee should be approved.

#### 20.2 Report of the Meetings Held on 5 October and 3 November 2020

#### **RECEIVED**:

- i. A report on the meetings of the Audit Committee held on 5 October 2020 and 3 November 2020, covering:
  - Annual Financial Return (dealt with as a substantive item by Council see minute 12 above)

- Assessment of the Impact of COVID-19 on the University of Liverpool as a Going Concern (dealt with as a substantive item by Council – see minute 13 above)
- Terms of Reference, Constitution and Membership of the Audit Committee
- Moody's Revised Credit Rating for the University of Liverpool
- Reports of the Internal Auditors
- Cyber Security Report
- Private Meetings.

# AGREED:

ii. The revised Terms of Reference, Constitution and Membership of the Audit Committee, which had been revised to reflect CUC best practice, should be approved.

# 21. Education Committee

# RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Education Committee held on 20 October 2020, covering:
  - Terms of Reference, Constitution and Membership 2020/21
  - Annual Quality Report
  - Institutional Survey Results 2020 (National Student Survey NSS) National Student Survey 2020 – Institutional Overview Libraries, Museums and Galleries NSS 2020 Response and Action Plan CSD Student Satisfaction Surveys NSS 2020
  - Key Findings from the Graduate Outcomes 2017/18 Survey
  - Update on Online Partnership Activities
  - Quarter 4 Performance Report.

## AGREED:

ii. The revised Terms of Reference, Constitution and Membership (which had been updated to clarify which posts were ex-officio and those that were appointed to the Committee and to reflect the reporting line from the Student Success Boards) should be approved.

## 22. Health and Safety Governance Committee Annual Report

## **RECEIVED**:

i. The Annual Report of the Health and Safety Governance Committee (HSGC).

# **REPORTED**:

ii. As the University's governing body, Council had strategic oversight of all matters related to health and safety for the University. In order to discharge its legal and regulatory responsibilities, Council should seek assurance that effective health and safety arrangements were in place and working. The report provided information on the following key topics:

- Health and safety governance arrangements
- COVID-19 pandemic
- Institutional health and safety plan
- University health and safety policy and codes of practice
- Fire safety
- Key performance indicators (including progress with HASMAP)
- Reports and letters from enforcing authorities
- Emergency arrangements/business continuity
- Accidents and incidents annual review
- Safeguarding annual report 2019/20
- Update from meeting of HSGC held 21 October 2020.

The HSGC Annual Report, therefore, covered key elements in order to enable Council to discharge its obligations.

iii. The COVID-19 pandemic had had a significant effect on normal health and safety arrangements and the report outlined where changes had been made to ensure health and safety was managed in a COVID-19 environment.

# AGREED:

iv. The Annual Report should be approved.

# 23. Joint Committee on Honorary Degrees

## **REPORTED**:

i. Further to the recommendations approved by Council at its July 2019 meeting, the following individuals had accepted the invitation to receive an honorary degree:

John Barnes Professor Denise Barrett-Baxendale Nick Burgess Raymond Chan Professor Sir John Curtice Sir Kenny Dalglish Michael Eakin Leslie Evans Jonathan Falkingham Andy Grant Sir Iain Hall Lady Pauline Harris Joy Hockey Peter Johnson Nisha Katona Sir Peter Rigby Lady Estelle Wolfson.

As a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, the 2020 graduation ceremonies had unfortunately been postponed. It was hoped that the honorary graduands referred to above would receive their degrees during ceremonies in the summer of 2021.

ii. In accordance with the provisions of Ordinance 28 (Honorary Degrees), the Joint Committee on Honorary Degrees had met to consider nominations which had been received for the conferment of honorary degrees, and had made a number of recommendations.

# AGREED:

iii. The recommendations of the Joint Committee on Honorary Degrees in relation to the conferment of honorary degrees, as endorsed by Senate at its meeting held on 4 November 2020, should be approved.

## 24. Nominations Committee

## **RECEIVED**:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Nominations Committee held on 3 November 2020, covering:
  - Revised Terms of Reference
  - Appointments to existing vacancies for Council-appointed members of University committees and other bodies.

## AGREED:

- ii. The remit of the Nominations Committee should be broadened by the following addition to its Terms of Reference: To oversee the arrangements for the induction, development and annual appraisal of Council members.
- iii. The following individuals should be appointed to the Committees indicated for the periods stated:

Committee	Nominee	Period of appointment
Audit Committee	Ms Vanessa Griffiths	24.11.20-31.7.23
Health and Safety	Ms Vanessa Griffiths	24.11.20-31.7.23
Governance Committee		
Joint Committee on	Ms Fiona Cullen	24.11.20-31.7.23
Honorary Degrees		
Joint Committee on	Dr Kashmir Gill	24.11.20-31.7.23
Honorary Degrees		
Nominations Committee	Mrs Helen Miller	24.11.20-31.7.21
Planning and Resources	Mr Ed Fishwick	24.11.20-31.7.23
Committee		
Remuneration	Dr Roger Platt	24.11.20-31.7.23
Committee		
Research and Impact	Dr Kashmir Gill	24.11.20-31.7.23
Committee		

# 25. Planning and Resources Committee

# RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Planning and Resources Committee held on 3 November 2020, covering the following items:
  - Annual Financial Return (dealt with as a substantive item by Council see minute 12 above)
  - Assessment of the Impact of COVID-19 on the University of Liverpool as a Going Concern (dealt with as a substantive item by Council – see minute 13 above)
  - Institutional Plan 2020/21 2024/25 (dealt with as a substantive item by Council see minute 12 above)
  - Capital Mandates
    Condition Improvements 2020-22
    Key Infrastructure and Investment 2020-23
  - Terms of Reference, Constitution and Membership 2020/21
  - PPC Review and Process 2020/21
  - Business Travel Policy
  - Public Realm 2020-22
  - Moody's Revised Credit Rating for the University of Liverpool.

# AGREED:

- ii. The capital mandate proposing the expenditure of £15m across 2020-22 for various condition improvement works (to improve targeted buildings up to Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors system grade B) should be approved.
- iii. The capital mandate proposing the expenditure of £10.5m across 2020-23 for various condition improvement works (to improve and upgrade infrastructure, including power supplies, plant, lifts and building management systems) should be approved.

## 26. Remuneration Committee

## **RECEIVED** and **NOTED**:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Remuneration Committee held on 3 November 2020, covering the following items:
  - Annual Review of the Terms of Reference
  - Annual Remuneration Report to Council 2019/20
  - Russell Group and UCEA Salary Survey Analysis
  - A Report on Senior Staff Matters
  - The Annual Summary of the Vice-Chancellor's Expenses.

## 27. Research and Impact Committee

# **RECEIVED** and **NOTED**:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Research and Impact Committee held on 21 October 2020, covering the following items:
  - Knowledge Exchange Performance and Strategy
  - Project RISE
  - REF Institutional Environment Statement.

## 28. Committee on Research Ethics

## **RECEIVED**:

i. The Annual Report from the Committee on Research Ethics (CORE).

# **REPORTED**:

- ii. The University required 'that all staff and student research projects which involve human participants or human material or personal information should receive formal ethical approval before they commence'. Studies that had a high intrinsic risk were reviewed at a pan-University level by three Central University Ethics Committees that included lay members, while studies with an intrinsically low risk were reviewed by research ethics committees located in Faculties.
- iii. The report reviewed the operation of the ethics review process during the last academic year, assessing the challenges posed by the pandemic, and considering the overall pattern of activity during the year and the future evolution of the process.
- iv. Research undertaken at Leahurst had a specific aspect as it often involved the interaction between researchers from Veterinary Science and the owners of animals brought into the Leahurst Veterinary Surgery. It would be advantageous if the Committee included a representative from the School of Veterinary Science to help to ensure that the approach to research ethics took full account of the University's veterinary practices.

## AGREED:

v. The proposed amendment to the constitution of the CORE to include a representative from the School of Veterinary Science should be approved.

## 29. Senate

## **RECEIVED**:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Senate held on 4 November 2020, covering the following item:
  - Annual Report on Quality and Standards.

## **REPORTED**:

- ii. The Annual Report on Quality and Standards covered: activity during 2019/20; external matters; approvals of new activity; monitoring and review activities; development and enhancement activities; and evaluation and oversight of processes. COVID-19 had introduced a unique set of circumstances and a number of changes had been needed to all processes in relation to quality assurance and the student experience.
- iii. On 3 April 2020, the Office for Students had published its 'Guidance for providers about quality and standards during coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic'. The report provided assurance that the University continued to meet OfS expectations and maintained consistent quality and standards throughout this challenging time.

# AGREED:

iv. The report providing assurance to Council regarding the outputs of the quality assurance processes and confirming the continuing quality and standards of provision across the University and its collaborative partners in the UK and overseas should be approved.

## **ROUTINE ITEMS**

## 30. Use of the University Seal

# **RECEIVED** and **NOTED**:

i. A summary of uses of the University Seal since the last meeting.

## 31. Date of Next Meeting

## NOTED:

i. The next meeting would be held at 2pm on Tuesday 9 February 2021.