

UNRESERVED MINUTES

UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL

COUNCIL (1029)

MEETING OF THE COUNCIL

17 May 2017

Present: The Earl of Derby, President (in the Chair); Mr C Graham, Vice-President; Mr D McDonnell, Pro-Chancellor; Professor J Beer, Vice-Chancellor; Mr P Hackett, Deputy Vice-Chancellor; Professor D Birch, Pro-Vice-Chancellor for Research and Impact; Ms C Booth; Dr R Platt; Mrs A Pointing; Dr A Scott; Mrs P Young; Professor F Beveridge; Dr F Marret-Davies; Professor R McGrath; and Mr S Turner, President of the Guild of Students.

Apologies: Professor G Brown, Pro-Vice-Chancellor for Education; Professor S Dawson; Dr P Johnson; Sir Colin Lucas; and Dame Lorna Muirhead.

In attendance: Mrs E Leonard (Minute Secretary).

DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

1.1 Disclosures of Interest

Members were invited to disclose any potential conflicts of interest they had in relation to the items on the agenda. Any such conflicts are noted under relevant minute headings.

MINUTES/COMMUNICATIONS

2.1 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

AGREED:

- i. The minutes of the meeting held 22 February 2017 should be approved as an accurate record, subject to the inclusion of the Vice-President in the list of those present.
- ii. The decisions taken during the February meeting should be formally ratified, as the meeting had not been quorate.

2.2 Matters Arising on the Minutes

- a. Liverpool Online (item 4.1 refers)

REPORTED:

- i. The renewal of the partnership agreement with Laureate Inc. to collaborate on the development and delivery of Liverpool Online degrees had not yet been finalised. The legal teams were working to resolve an issue relating to the termination clauses of the agreement.

2.3 President of Council's Communications

[Mr David McDonnell declared an interest as a future recipient of an honorary degree and Dr Andrew Scott declared an interest as Chair of the Enterprise Board.]

REPORTED:

- i. Since the last business meeting of Council, the President of Council had taken action on its behalf to:
 - Approve a recommendation made by the Vice-Chancellor acting on behalf of Senate that Mr David McDonnell should be invited to accept the honorary degree of Doctor of Laws.
 - Approve the appointment of Mr Paul Ewing as a lay member of the Enterprise Board for the period from 17 March 2017 to 31 July 2019.

AGREED:

- ii. The action taken by the President of Council described in 2.3i above should be endorsed.

2.4 Vice-Chancellor's Communications

a. Statement Regarding Dismissal

[Dr R Platt declared an interest as a member of the Appeal Panel in the case.]

RECEIVED:

- i. A leaflet that the joint trade unions had requested be provided to Council members regarding the dismissal of a member of staff.

NOTED:

- ii. The University had followed all due process in dismissing the individual.
- iii. The case could not be discussed in more detail as it was sub judice.

b. VC's Engagements

REPORTED:

- i. Since the last meeting of Council, the VC had visited, met with, hosted or attended meetings regarding the following:

2/3 March	Russell Group Away Days Nottingham
6 March	Speaker at UUK International Students: economic impact conference
10 March	Visit to Uppsala University, Sweden
13 March	Saxton Bampfylde VC dinner 'The evolving nature of the University Council'
15 March	Russell Group/Global Counsel Dinner with Lord Mandelson: Impact of Brexit
20 March	Schools that Work for Everyone Reception at 10 Downing Street
	Executive Search Firm Launch, London Campus
24 March	UCAS CEX Interview Panel

4 April	Hosted Clinical Research Review dinner with Trusts
5 April	Hosted UUK Brexit dinner with NW VCs
6 April	Mr WANG Yongli, Minister Counsellor for Education visit to UoL
7 April	Aintree Grand Women's Summit
25 April	Albert Dock report launch
26 April	UCAS Board
	Royal College of Physicians with LCC/KQ
27 April	ECU Board
	Russell Group Board
28 April	Gave CUC Spring Plenary on the theme of 'partnerships'
2 May	Visit from Andy Cooke QPM, Chief Constable
3 May	KQ and LSP Board
	Guild Awards
5 May	UoL 32nd Athletic Union Awards Dinner
9 May	Historic Royal Palaces Reception and Concert, Hillsborough Castle, Belfast (HRH Prince Charles and Duchess of Cornwall)
11 May	Gave Plenary at Universities HR Annual Conference, Newcastle
12 May	Universities UK Members' Meeting

ITEMS FOR APPROVAL/DISCUSSION

3.1 Carbon Management Plan

RECEIVED:

- i. The proposed Carbon Management Plan.

REPORTED:

- ii. The Plan had been developed to set a carbon emissions target as part of the University's commitment to improve energy efficiency across the estate, reduce emissions and contribute to sustainable development.
- iii. The following carbon reduction targets had been set (using a 2014-15 baseline): 1.8% by 2021 and 6.1% by 2026.
- iv. The aim was to achieve the carbon targets:
 - by adopting Estates Strategy 2026+ and Master-Plan 2026+
 - through improved space use and measured utilisation
 - by ensuring that new and refurbished buildings are designed to maximise realistic carbon savings
 - through energy generation projects
 - via behaviour change, staff training and engagement activities.
- v. The project would be funded through existing internal funds for low carbon infrastructure (Revolving Green Fund), additional loans and grants such as through Salix (interest-free Government funding to the public sector to improve their energy efficiency and reduce carbon emissions) as well as other applicable internal funding streams.

AGREED:

- vi. The Carbon Management Plan should be approved.

- vii. Council should receive an annual report on progress being made against the Plan. The next report should provide more detail regarding the non-achievement of the previous plan.

3.2 Former Dale Hall Residential Site – Disposal

RECEIVED:

- i. A paper detailing a proposed property disposal.

REPORTED:

- ii. The former Dale Hall residential site had been declared surplus to requirements as part of the Residential Strategy 2011 and had been marketed for disposal.
- iii. Following a competitive marketing process and subsequent negotiations, the terms had been provisionally agreed with the preferred developer, subject to planning.
- iv. Initial discussions had taken place with the Planning Authority which had indicated the outline development scheme presented would likely be acceptable, under planning guidelines, subject to the formal process and public consultation.
- v. It was considered that this transaction represented best value to the University.

AGREED:

- vi. The strategy for the disposal of the former Dale Hall residential site on the basis outlined, to the preferred developer, Elan Homes, should be approved.

3.3 Access Agreement: Entry 2018-19

RECEIVED:

- i. The University's Access Agreement for 2018-19 entry which had been submitted to OFFA on Wednesday 26 April 2017.

REPORTED:

- ii. The agreement would now be considered by OFFA, with final approval expected in July 2017.
- iii. A wide range of stakeholders had been consulted as part of the development of the Access Agreement and the University continued to develop an evidence based approach with a focus on areas of most need and that would have the greatest level of impact.
- iv. The Access Agreement built on the previous good practice and had been carefully crafted to address the revised institutional guidance provided by OFFA in February 2017.
- v. The University planned to maintain a strong investment in Access related activities at £1,726,880 in 2018-19.
- vi. Expenditure on activities and resources aimed at Student Success and Progression had increased to £4.39m (in total) in 2018-19. This represented a

significant increase compared to the 2017-18 agreement and reflected a revised methodology which now included a calculation based on the inclusion of academic staff salaries. This change of methodology had been agreed with OFFA during 2016.

- vii. As highlighted in the 2017-18 agreement, the University was now also providing financial support to NHS students via the Liverpool Bursary. These students were previously funded by the NHS, but were now included in the Access Agreement following changes to NHS funding.
- viii. For 2018-19 the University would be maintaining the Liverpool Bursary at the same levels. For 2018-19, all students with a household income of up to £25,000 would receive a £2,000 bursary whilst students whose household income falls between £25,000 and £35,000 would receive a bursary of £750. In line with the strategic priorities outlined by OFFA, the University had introduced a range of new bursaries and scholarships aimed at particular disadvantaged groups. The aim was to provide a total of £10,074,547 in 2018-19.
- ix. Expenditure on OFFA countable activities remained in line with previous levels at 31.2% of Higher Fee Income in 2018-19.

NOTED:

- x. Work was underway as part of the Education Action Plan to encourage students to engage with activities which help them to build social and cultural capital, such as the option of studying abroad, undertaking work placements and receiving mentorship by alumni and engaged employers.

AGREED:

- xi. The Access Agreement should be endorsed.

3.4 Council Effectiveness Review 2017: Action Plan

RECEIVED:

- i. A proposed Action Plan to respond to the recommendations arising from the 2017 Council Effectiveness Review.

REPORTED:

- ii. Council had considered Professor Ella Ritchie's report on the Effectiveness Review of Council 2017 at its Away Day held on 29 March 2017. Professor Ritchie's recommendations had been broadly accepted and an Action Plan had been developed to respond to them.
- iii. A progress report would be submitted to the April 2018 Away Day meeting, when Council was also due to undertake its own annual effectiveness review.

NOTED:

- iv. Several strong applications had been received for the Director of Strategic Planning and Governance role. It was believed that the merger of the Strategic Planning and Governance functions, which was a common model across the sector, would strengthen governance.

AGREED:

- v. The Action Plan should be approved.

3.5 Compliance with the CUC Higher Education Code of Governance

RECEIVED:

- i. A report providing a further update on progress made against the actions previously agreed to enhance compliance with the CUC Higher Education Code of Governance, and summarising the progress made against actions agreed at the April 2016 Away Day to increase Council's effectiveness.

REPORTED:

- ii. The CUC Code had not been updated since its publication. The University remained compliant in all areas reported as such previously.
- iii. A full report on compliance would be submitted every three years, with the next full report due in 2018.

AGREED:

- iv. The approach taken and progress made in implementing all actions should be endorsed.

ITEM FOR NOTE

4.1 Diversity and Equality Annual Report 2015-16

RECEIVED:

- i. A report providing an update on activity that took place in the academic year 2015-16 to implement the University's commitment and responsibilities to diversity and equality.

REPORTED:

- ii. The report detailed key policy changes, charter mark updates, staff training, events and community engagement activities. Appendices included the annual report on the Dignity at Work and Study Policy, results of the Stonewall Workplace Equality Index 2017, and staff/student demographic data and analysis.
- iii. Some of the key achievements during 2015-16 included:
 - New policies and services were launched including:
 - Equality Framework
 - Strategy 2026
 - Time to Change pledge and the GiveGetGo programme
 - Employee Assistance Programme.
 - In the Stonewall Workplace Equality Index the University achieved an increased score and climbed to the 127th position in the ranking.

- The total proportion of staff that had completed diversity and equality training increased to an all-time high of 75%.
 - Events and campaigns were held throughout the year, including a hugely successful Rainbow Laces campaign by Sport Liverpool and the Guild.
- iv. Activity taking place in 2016-17 included the development of a new Equality Action Plan and rolling out Equality Impact Assessment training. Initiatives included joining the government's new Disability Confident Charter and a review of the Dignity at Work and Study policies.
- v. Since the report had been circulated, the University had achieved an institutional Silver level Athena SWAN award for the work undertaken to improve gender equality. Examples of progress included:
- An increase in the proportion of female professors from 18% to 24% since 2013.
 - Increased gender balance in appointing academic staff.
 - The introduction of a University wide mentoring scheme for all staff.
 - The setting up of networks for female early career researchers and for staff and students who are parents.
 - Improved family friendly facilities.

The Institute of Translational Medicine had successfully renewed its Silver award and the School of Physical Sciences had achieved the first Silver award for the Faculty of Science and Engineering.

AGREED:

- vi. It would be beneficial for Council to receive a diversity and equality training session, to include unconscious bias.

PLANNING AND RESOURCES COMMITTEE

5.1 Report of the Meeting of the Planning and Resources Committee held 21 March 2017

RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Planning and Resources Committee held on 21 March 2017, covering:
- Mandates
 - Materials Innovation Factory
 - Staff Survey

5.2 South Campus Mandate

RECEIVED:

- i. A mandate requesting the release of the next tranche of funding in the sum of £7.5m to allow the planned programme of proposed works on South Campus to continue.

AGREED:

- ii. The release of £7.5m for the continuation of the South Campus strategy projects should be approved.

5.3 Materials Innovation Factory (MIF)

REPORTED:

- i. The Planning and Resources Committee had received a report outlining the reasons for which the construction of the MIF had exceeded budget by £2.2m.
- ii. The Planning and Resources Committee had agreed that, as a guide, contingencies should be set at 30% at the feasibility stage of any project, reducing to 20% at initiation.

AGREED:

- iii. It would be beneficial for Council to receive information regarding key capital projects (to include information regarding savings delivered etc.) in future.

SENATE

6. Report of the Meeting of the Senate held 22 March 2017

RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Senate held on 22 March 2017, covering:
 - Annual Complaints Monitoring Report for the Academic Session 2015-16
 - Academic Compliance Report for the Academic Session 2015-16
 - Approval of a draft Policy on Misconduct in Research
 - Approval of a draft Policy on Research Integrity
 - Development of the Access Agreement
 - Senate's consideration of the Staff Survey results (with a focus on responses from academic staff).

OTHER COMMITTEES

7.1 Audit Committee

RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Audit Committee held on 9 March 2017, covering:
 - KPMG's Audit Planning Memorandum 2016-17
 - Planning for the 2016-17 Year End audit
 - Annual Report on Data Assurance 2015-16
 - Update on Risk Management Framework and Strategic Risk Register
 - Reports of the internal auditors.

REPORTED:

- ii. The FRC had introduced a new requirement for long-form audit reports for companies with shares or debts listed on any market. The external auditors would submit an example enhanced audit report to the June meeting of the Audit Committee to familiarise members with the content of such reports.
- iii. In order to avoid any recurrence of the delays and cost overrun experienced in the audit and sign off of the 2015-16 financial statements, a number of improvements had been agreed with the external auditors which had either been, or were in the process of being, implemented.

AGREED:

- iv. KPMG's Audit Planning Memorandum 2016-17 should be endorsed.

7.2 Health and Safety Governance Committee

RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Health and Safety Governance Committee held on 22 March 2017, covering:
 - Policy and Code of Practice on Health and Safety Risk Management and Risk Assessment
 - Strategy Implementation Progress Report
 - Business Continuity Management.

REPORTED:

- ii. The new Policy and Code of Practice on Health and Safety Risk Management and Risk Assessment brought together existing University guidance on risk assessment with new documents and processes for compiling hazard inventories and local risk registers and for completing risk assessments. The document expanded on key risk assessment management responsibilities and emphasised the importance of competence in all aspects of risk management.

AGREED:

- iii. The Policy and Code of Practice on Health and Safety Risk Management and Risk Assessment should be approved.
- iv. Health and Safety Governance Committee reports to Council should include information regarding those health and safety KPIs that were likely to change regularly, noting that the full report on performance against KPIs was submitted to Council in November each year.

7.3 Remuneration Committee

RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Remuneration Committee held on 21 March 2017, covering:

- Review of the Vice-Chancellor's remuneration and annual objective setting
- USS Pensions and Pensions Strategy
- Outcomes of the 2016 Professional Services Leadership Team and Professional Services Senior Management Staff Salary Review
- Summary of the 2016 Annual Review Outcomes
- Report on Senior Staff Matters
- Annual Report on Senior Staff with Positions on Boards/Membership of Formal Outside Bodies and details of any remuneration.

AGREED:

- ii. The recommendations made by the President of Council in relation to the Vice-Chancellor's remuneration and the personal objectives as agreed between the Vice-Chancellor and the President of Council should be approved.
- iii. Given the amount of senior level recruitment underway, an updated organisational structure chart should be circulated. It would also be useful to include a session during this year's Carden Park event to introduce the new leaders.

REPORTS TO COUNCIL FROM THE STRATEGIC COMMITTEES

8.1 Education Committee

RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Education Committee held on 7 March 2017, covering:
 - Languages Strategy
 - TEF
 - Employability
 - Strategy and Investment Meetings
 - National Student Survey (NSS).

NOTED:

- ii. The University's drop of eight places to 67th in the Guardian University Guide 2018 League Table was disappointing. Particular areas of weakness were Student to Staff ratio and Career Prospects. The University was redoubling its efforts around employability, including in relation to student enterprise.
- iii. Colleagues in External Relations, Marketing and Communications were developing several communication plans to respond to a number of different scenarios in respect of the University's potential TEF outcomes and their associated risks. The link between TEF and differentiated fee increases had been postponed until 2020.
- iv. The institutional response rate at the close of this year's NSS was 43%, below the 50% response rate required to meet the NSS publication threshold. This was significantly below both the national response rate (68%) and the University's 2016 response rate (76%). The NUS had reported that at least eight institutions with a boycott had response rates below 50% at the close of the survey. HEFCE had held meetings with those institutions with a response rate less than 50% to

discuss the next steps, and a decision on how the data would be used was expected by 23 June 2017. There was an expectation that league table ranking systems would find a way to continue to publish full data sets without gaps in institutional data given that they adopted their own methodologies.

8.2 Research and Impact Committee

RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Research and Impact Committee held on 8 March 2017, covering:
 - Strategy and Investment Meetings
 - Report on the University's progress against ambitions to grow world-leading outputs and the volume of research meeting policy principles 3* and 4*
 - Partnerships Framework
 - REF2021 consultation
 - Global Challenges Research Fund.

NOTED:

- ii. In relation to the University's progress against ambitions to grow world-leading outputs (KPI 4) and the volume of research meeting policy principles 3* and 4* (KPI 6), progress was being made but there remained a significant gap between current performance and Strategy 2026 targets, particularly with regard to KPI 4. Plans were being formulated to address the gaps.
- iii. The uncertainties around the rules of REF 2021 constrained the making of detailed plans, though overall plans were not affected.
- iv. There had been several notable Global Challenges Research Fund successes including: a number of MRC Foundation Awards, a NERC Award, two Royal Society Challenge grants, and a Royal Academy of Engineering grant.

ROUTINE ITEMS

9.1 Use of the University Seal

RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. A summary of uses of the University Seal since the last meeting.

9.2 HR Summary Report of Action Taken Under Delegated Powers

RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. A summary of HR related actions taken under delegated powers since the last meeting.

OTHER MATTERS

10.1 Thanks

NOTED:

- i. Mr Jon Haymer had recently tendered his resignation with immediate effect owing to his employment circumstances.

AGREED:

- ii. Mr Haymer should be thanked for his excellent contribution during the last seven plus years, and wished well for the future.

10.2 Date of Next Meeting

NOTED:

- i. The next meeting would be held at 2pm on Wednesday 5 July 2017.